

Enharmonic Substitution in Bernard Herrmann's Early Works

By William Wrobel

In the course of my research of Bernard Herrmann scores over the years, I've recently come across what I assume to be an interesting notational inconsistency in Herrmann's scores. Several months ago I began to earnestly focus on his scores prior to 1947, especially while doing research of his *Citizen Kane* score (1941) for my *Film Score Rundowns* website (<http://www.filmmusic.cjb.net>). Also I visited UCSB to study his *Symphony* (1941) and earlier scores. What I noticed is that roughly prior to 1947 Herrmann tended to consistently write enharmonic notes for certain diatonic chords, especially E substituted for Fb (F-flat) in, say, Fb major 7th (Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb) chords, and (less frequently) B substituted for Cb in, say, Ab minor (Ab/Cb/Eb) triads. Occasionally I would see instances of other note exchanges such as Gb for F# in a D maj 7 chord.

This enharmonic substitution (or "equivalence" if you prefer that term) is overwhelmingly consistent in Herrmann's notational practice in scores roughly prior to 1947, and curiously abandoned by the composer afterwards. The notational "inconsistency," therefore, relates to the change of practice split between these two periods of Herrmann's career, almost a form of "Before" and "After" portrayal of his notational habits. Indeed, after examination of several dozens of his scores in the "After" period, I have seen (*so far* in this ongoing research) only one instance of enharmonic substitution similar to what Herrmann engaged in before 1947 (see my discussion in point # 19 on *Battle of Neretva*).

Some people might be skeptical that Herrmann (or any composer) would change his notation habits several years after the start of a professional composing career. They may counter that it can be "explained" away by any of many "variables" such as economy of notation (less accidentals such as sharp and flat symbols placed before notes), freedom to notate without a key signature, consideration of transposing versus non-transposing instruments, consideration for the ease of what the performer reads, and special conditions regarding voice leading, and so forth.

The intent of this paper is to *show* this "Before" and "After" phenomenon based on a study of Herrmann's scores spanning a forty-year period. I will cite many precise scores/cues/bars that will hopefully serve as a preliminary base upon which to show my point. I am not necessarily attempting to "prove" a point since I may need a sample of thousands of examples in order to statistically demonstrate a clear change of Herrmann's notation habits in this regard. However, I hope to narrow down the complexity by focusing on the unusual Fb note in Herrmann's scores. The F-flat note would be among the least common found of the seven diatonic flat notes in most works by composers. For instance, one normally does not find many Fb major or minor chords in a composition as compared to, say, the Gb or Bb chords, and even Cb chords.

Now: Certain root assumptions are presumed that I will now explain. First of all, we are focusing on a composer (Herrmann) who was definitely *not* a twelve-tone or *atonal* composer. Twelve-tone music tends to have no or little tonal consideration in

diatonic terms, and enharmonic exchange is not unusual in such works. It is assumed that there will be enharmonic substitution of all or most pitch-classes.

Secondly, we need to establish ourselves, therefore, with so-called “Western” music based on the diatonic scale of eight notes (consisting of whole steps and half steps arranged in alphabetical order). As a result, a “correctly” [logically] constructed chord written on paper (in terms of basic music theory) is based on intervals of thirds, most easily memorized in “proper” letter/note sequence as F-A-C-E-G-B-D (or if one prefers, C-E-G-B-D-F-A). Exceptions would include the construction of suspended chords in which the suspended note “suspends” or replaces the third note in relation to the root note. So, in terms of standard or conventionally/traditionally constructed diatonic music, the “correct” name for a note a whole tone above a letter/note must be the next letter.

For example, a sixth note is a whole tone above a fifth, so an A maj 6 chord has the correctly written letter sequence of A-C#-E-F#, not A-C#-E-Gb (although obviously it would “sound” the same). The interval between E to Gb is now a diminished third instead of a major 2nd (as E to F# would be). Another example would be the F maj b5 (flat 5th). One might think that F-A-B is perfectly acceptable, and besides, it looks neater because there are no accidentals! But it would “technically” be incorrect because the *nature* of the chord is a major with a flattened fifth. The fifth of the F root note is C, not B. So for this specific F maj b 5th chord, the proper letter pattern is F-A-Cb—although everyone would agree that the Cb and B “tones” (what you hear) are enharmonic or sound exactly the same. However, while the “tones” are the same, the “notes” (what you read as written symbols for the tones) are decidedly not the same and can never be “equivalent.”

So the sequence used is separated by thirds since most chords are built upon third (tertial) intervals. Even a perfect 5th is built upon two intervals of thirds (min-maj or maj-min). If a diatonic composer intended to construct a major seventh chord, then that would be normally written as a maj-min-maj set of intervals, such as C-E-G-B for the C maj 7 chord. If he wanted a half-diminished 7th tonality, then the set would normally be written as a min-min-maj set of intervals (for example, Bb-Db-Fb-Ab for the Bb half-diminished 7th chord). Based on the diatonic structure, therefore, it makes better sense in notation to write in a third-interval letter sequence, although on a practical “hearing” level it wouldn’t matter if the performer played and the listener heard an enharmonic tone.

Traditionally, therefore, to write “right,” so to speak, one normally constructs chords on the partitur in third-interval structures. Far be it from me to criticize “black sheep” diatonic composers who would rather be free to write music on paper in an unconventional manner now and then in regards to enharmonic notes! It is certainly not my intention to question Herrmann’s musicianship. I simply wish to share my observation that Herrmann spelled chords differently between two phases of his career. He tended to consistently notate enharmonic exchanges in his “early” works (say, before 1947) and to consistently avoid that practice (with few exceptions) in his middle (say, 1947 to 1965) and late (say, 1966 to 1975) career. These are not simply occasional “quirks” of writing, but almost a day-and-night consistent change of notation regarding enharmonic notes. Herrmann is not alive to elaborate on this phenomenon, unfortunately, so there can be a wide range of debatable theories or conjectures as to why he changed his notational habits in this matter.

My main thrust, however, is not to give “reasons” but to provide the data to show the differences of notation. I will offer some speculations, and readers/scholars can make their own conjectures (pro or con), but my main focus is to provide actual data showing the notational differences roughly “Before” and “After” 1947. In Herrmann’s scores written in the Fifties to his death in 1975, he consistently notated Fb chords, say, with the Fb note included, not exchanged for its enharmonic substitute (E). Roughly before 1947, however, he did engage in such enharmonic substitution just as consistently, whether for transposing or non-transposing instruments, single players or orchestral players. I will focus on the unusual Fb note since that note/tone would especially stand out in scores. My intent is to provide preliminary data to show this discrepancy between the tonal meaning (what you actually hear) and the notational meaning (what you see symbolized on paper as notes) between his early works and his later works (again, divided sometime in the late Forties).

Obviously tonal music is not dependent upon the “notes” written on paper (E “sounds” the same as Fb). But for some reason Herrmann decided to notate them in third-interval letter sequencing later in his career. It can be that Herrmann in his earlier works simply did not “care” that much how the tone was notated as long as the desired tone is played. Then he either gradually (in the space of a few years) or suddenly (in far lesser time) seemed to “care” based on the apparent disappearance of enharmonic substitution. As given earlier, not being a twelve-tone composer, evidence suggests (however “soft” the evidence currently is because of the still relatively small sample of examples) that Herrmann decided for some reason to either abruptly stop or dramatically lessen this practice of exchanging notes for the same tone, and stick with third-interval standards (e.g., Fb-Ab-Cb-Eb for the Fb maj 7th instead of the enharmonic notation of E-Ab-Cb-Eb or even E-Ab-B-Eb!). There may indeed be specific or generalized “variables” involved (perhaps), but this would not explain why later, with the same instruments (transposing or non-transposing, orchestral or single-player), and with the same conditions, his notation was consistently different in the middle and late periods of his professional career as opposed to his earlier notation in regards to enharmonic substitution.

Why he did this is not the focus of this paper. The key focus is to present a list of comparison “before” and “after” examples, as many examples as possible given the availability of scores to this author. Again, the reason may simply be that he did not think it was all that important in his earlier career, as long as the tone was played as part of the overall chord “sound” or tonality he wanted. As I research scores, I am also looking for “evidence” that will contradict my contention, so that if I see the same kind of enharmonic substitutions in his later scores as in his earlier ones, then I will indeed record them. So far I have only detected one such cue (“The Tanks” in *Battle of Neretva*). Tomorrow I may find more, but so far that cue is the only one amongst hundreds of examples showing no enharmonic substitution. If I or another interested researcher can find many of the same enharmonic substitutions later in his career as well, then obviously my contention would be proved incorrect. I rather doubt if this will happen because just the opposite has happened so far: a consistent practice in the “After” period of notating according to diatonic third-interval sequencing of notes.

Perhaps, as one conjecture, Herrmann decided that writing an Fb maj 7th (“normally” written as Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb) as E/Ab/B/Eb was terribly awkward looking

(although it obviously “sounds” as the F_b maj 7th when played). Besides, *technically* it is more “correct” to write the F_b instead of E anyway. Perhaps he changed his mind and proceeded to change his earlier habit. Habits can indeed be changed, though it may take constant conscious effort until the new practice becomes habit. Herrmann changed in the mid-Thirties when he abandoned the experimentation of strange chord tonalities of his youthful career; he changed in the late Thirties after he scored “Dauber” for the *Columbia Workshop* (read about Robert Kosovsky’s insightful 2000 dissertation, “Bernard Herrmann’s Radio Music For The Columbia Workshop” at <http://www.uib.no/People/midi/soundtrackweb/herrmann/news/>); he changed the preference frequency of his chord tonalities in his later career (writing, for instance, far more half-diminished 7ths and minMaj 7ths), and so forth. So it is no great stretch of the imagination to accept that he could make a simple change of his notation habits regarding enharmonic notes.

Perhaps Herrmann in his early career made notational decisions based on purely personal tastes without too much concern about enharmonic differences. No consideration about the third-interval inconsistencies were given because “misspelling” the notes made no practical difference in terms of what would be actually *heard*. So, with that attitude, as long as the note is pragmatically tonal-functional (the tone being a part of the chord *sound*) then the notational discrepancy (in terms of third-interval structuring) would be relatively unimportant. However, when a composer considers it equally as important, then the notational meaning (what is written based on the intended tonality) will more accurately reflect the tonal meaning (what is heard). Of course, if the composer employs a chord that utilizes double flats and sharps, he may switch to a more familiar notation (such as Ab-C-D instead of the Ab-C-Ebb for the Ab major flat 5th triad). He may also take the player into consideration and make the notation easier for him to instantly read without unnecessary mental processing. A composer may simply have distaste for complicated notation (excessive accidentals) and opt for simple enharmonic substitution (such as E for F_b, and B for C_b).

In the matter of taking the performers’ convenience into consideration, I rather doubt if that was uppermost in Herrmann’s mind when notating a score. He had a tendency to be rather harsh and demanding towards musicians during recording sessions. He made it known that he was in charge at the podium in front of them, although performers may rebel in their own way if they felt too pressured or harassed. It is unlikely that, in his earlier career, he simply wanted the players to feel more comfortable by reading an E instead of an F_b, but later in his career he would reverse his attitude towards them. So I do not think he was writing his scores for the convenience of the players in terms of enharmonic notation. Equally so, it is not likely he was motivated to adjust his notation simply for the convenience of researchers analyzing his scores later on! Moreover, I do not think “conventions” suddenly changed. More likely, Herrmann (for whatever reason) changed.

To show this, I will not only provide a list of examples but also expound on many of them and discuss salient points. So, in regards to the E/F_b “sound” (tonal meaning), I will demonstrate with my presently small sample how he consistently notated them differently between the two periods of his career. In the “Before” period (certainly 1945 and earlier), he consistently notated, say, F_b maj 7 chords in an enharmonic fashion (E-Ab-Cb-Eb and sometimes even as E-Ab-B-Eb). Whereas in the “After” period (certainly

in the Fifties and beyond) he consistently notated them in a technically “correct” tertial structure (Fb-Ab-Cb-Eb). Since the overwhelmingly greater part of his works lie within the “After” period, there will obviously be a disproportion in the amount of examples of that period as opposed to the examples available in the “Before” sample. Moreover, since the prevalence of the “darker” chords of, say, the Fb and Db min chords tend to be seen primarily in the “darker” scores or “darker” cues within certain scores (e.g., “Prelude” in *Citizen Kane*, “The Bridge” in *Journey To The Center of the Earth*, cues in *Taxi Driver*, etc.), it is unusual to find them in the “brighter” or romantic & comedic scores.

Let’s now examine in closer detail “Before” and “After” notation examples.

(1) Starting with the “Prelude” of *Citizen Kane*, one sees immediately in Bar 1 an example of enharmonic substitution. While three bassoons play the Kane motif with the three trombones, they play “a3” or unison as a single melody line. The muted trombones, however, play the two-bar phrase in triadic chord fashion. They play the G/B/E (E min 1st inversion) half note triad to Ab/B/Eb dotted quarter note triad back to G/B/E 8th notes to (Bar 2) G/B/E half note chord again to G/Bb/D (G min) half note chord.

Note that the second triad is Ab/B/Eb. Although it is not immediately recognizable in tertial structuring of chords, it is nevertheless the Ab minor (Ab/Cb/Eb) sound. It is Pos II that plays those B notes throughout the phrase (except for the last note of Bb as part of the G min triad). All the chords sounded in this phrase were minor chords (E min, Ab min, and G min). Apparently Herrmann decided to write “conveniently” and simply notate on paper the Cb note (part of the Ab min tonality) as the enharmonic B instead since the same player was playing the B notes already for the E min chord.

In Bars 3-4, the motif tonalities are augmented as major seventh chords as the three bass clarinets and contrabass bassoon play the combined chords. Bass clarinets first play the E [written F# a whole tone above since it is a transposing instrument]/Cb [written Db]/Eb [written F] half notes. Then they play Eb/Bb/D dotted quarter notes [written F/C/E] back to E/Cb/Eb to (Bar 4) E/Cb/Eb half notes again to Db/F/A half notes. The C.F. meanwhile plays the Ab half note to Eb dotted quarter note to Ab 8th note to (Bar 4) Ab to Gb half notes.

In the first chord in Bar 3, we hear the Fb maj 7 tonality (Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb). However, bass clarinet III plays the Fb tone but written as enharmonic E. This is repeated again in the 8th chord and then (in Bar 4) in the first chord as given (same Fb maj 7).

In Bar 12, the horns play the Fb maj 7 tonality as whole notes tied to half notes next bar. However, they are notated as E/Ab/Cb/Eb. So horn IV plays E [written B a perfect 5th above since it is a transposing instrument] instead of Fb [written as Cb a perfect 5th interval above].

In Bars 16-17, the Fags (bassoons) and C.F. play the Kane motif in triadic fashion (C.F. doubling Fag III except for the final chord). Just as the Pos (trombones) played in Bars 1-2, the Fags play the G/B/E (E min 1st inversion) half note chord to Ab/B/Eb dotted quarter notes to E min 8th chord again to (Bar 17) E min to G min half note chords. Once again, note that Fag II plays the enharmonic written B note in the Ab min triad (Ab/Cb/Eb) instead of the written Cb note.

In Bar 19, we come again to Bb transposing instruments. Instead of bass clarinets, we find Bb trumpets. On the dvd this is found at the 2:08 point in the scene immediately before the light in the room (where Kane is dying) shuts off (exterior view). Here the trumpets play the Ab/B/Eb quarter notes rinforzando-marked (> glyph above the notes). As transposing instruments, the chord is written as Bb/C#/F that translates in “C” pitch as Ab/B/Eb. Trumpet II plays the Cb tone (part of the Ab/Cb/Eb min triad tonality) written as B [C#] instead as Cb [Db].

In Bars 20-23, the bass clarinets play a series of half note chords (the bass flutes are playing the melody line). They play Ab/B/Eb to G/Bb/D to (Bar 21) Gb/A/Db to E/G#/B to (Bar 22) F#/A/C#, etc. Note that in the first triad we find once again the Ab min tonality, but bass clarinet II plays the written enharmonic B [C#] instead of Cb [Db]. That first half note chord in Bar 21 (Gb/A/Db) is quite interesting as well [written as transposing instruments as Ab/B/Eb]. What is it? Actually it is the unusual Gb min tonality (Gb/Bbb/Db). You can see how Herrmann opted to use the enharmonic A written note instead of the more awkward looking (but technically correct) double flat B.

In Bar 25, we find a vibe player sounding an enharmonic note. Combined vibes I and I sound the Fb maj 7 to F maj 7 half note chords. Vibe II plays dyad half notes E/Ab to F/A, while vibe I plays Cb/Eb to C/E. Once again, instead of the Fb written notes, we find the enharmonic E half note. So we find without variance the same consistency of notation, whether transposing or non-transposing orchestral players (instrumental choirs combined playing the chords) and solo players playing dyads as part of seventh chords. Moreover, two clarinets sound the Ab/E to A/C half notes, while bass flutes play Ab/Cb/Eb to A/C/E. So clarinet I plays the enharmonic written E [F#] instead of Fb [Gb].

In Bar 26, the Fags and C.F. play the combined Fb maj 7 tonality again. This time Fag III plays the written E enharmonic half note instead of the written Fb. Moreover, the timp is trill rolled on the E note as well! This point musically corresponds to the scene where the glass ball smashes on the floor when Kane dies. In Bar 27, Fag II again plays the enharmonic E instead of Fb.

In the “Dissolve” cue (M-37) of *Citizen Kane* (on the dvd refer to Chapter 7 starting at 4:18 thru :10 of Chapter 8), the horns in Bar 7 play (in 2/4 meter) the Eb/Ab/B/E half note seventh chord tied to final two bars. The prior chord in Bar 6 was the Ab maj 7 (Ab/C/Eb/G). So what we hear is actually the Fb maj 7 tonality again (Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb) but in different voicing arrangement, notated here in dual enharmonic fashion as E [instead of Fb]/Ab/B [instead of Cb]/Eb.

In Bar 3, we actually find a case where Herrmann notates the Ab min chord as the Ab/Cb/Eb notes (unlike the beginning of the “Prelude” and so forth). However, instead of starting off with the E min chord, this version of the Kane motif starts with the Ab min quarter note chord to G/Bb/D (G min) dotted 8th note chord to Ab min again to (Bar 4) Ab min quarter note chord to E/G/B (E min) quarter note chord. Herrmann decided here in this situation to have the Cb written with the Ab min being the initial chord, and then adding the Bb note with the next chord (G min). Remember also that in *most* cases, Herrmann tended to keep the Ab/Cb/Eb structure when he used the Fb maj 7th tonality (Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb) but using the E written enharmonic note to replace the Fb note. This also occurs in the “Xanadu” cue, Bar 8, where the trumpets play the Ab min chord as

Ab[Bb]/Cb[Db]/Eb[F]. Nevertheless, he consistently used the E as the enharmonic substitution for Fb, while inconsistently he would use B in lieu of Cb. After 1945, however, he would consistently use the Cb and consistently use the Fb written notes in the tertial interval chords (avoiding enharmonic substitutions, as I'll explain next).

(2) Next we come to an "After" example in "The Bridge" cue (R8/3-9/1, page 48 of the autograph score) of the 1959 feature film, *Journey To The Center Of The Earth*. Herrmann uses the same Fb and Eb maj 7 chords as he did in the "Prelude" of *Citizen Kane*. We find repeated "cells" of ascending to descending parallel half note major 7th chords set *Largo* in 4/2 time signature. In Bar 1, four bassoons (Fags) and two contra bassoons (C.Fags) play p < > pp (crescendo-decrescendo) root position Eb maj 7 (half note chord (Eb/G/Bb/D) to Fb maj 7 (Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb) to F maj 7 (F/A/C/E) back to Fb maj 7 to (Bar 2) Eb maj 7 (followed by three half rests). The C. Fags double Fags III & IV. So C.F. II and Fag IV play the half note sequence of Eb-Fb-F-Fb-Eb; C.F. I & Fag III play Bb-Cb-C-Cb-Bb. Fag II plays the sequence of G-Ab-A-Ab-G, while Fag I plays D-Eb-E-Eb to (Bar 2) D.

In Bar 2, four trombones (Pos) and two tubas take over this cell/bar pattern with exactly the same chords. In Bar 3, four Bb clarinets and two Bb clarinets take over the exact same pattern and chords. As transposing instruments, Herrmann customarily writes the transposed notes (not in "C" concert pitch) so that Bass clarinet II and clarinet IV (playing the root notes) play Eb [written F a whole tone above] to Fb [written Gb] to F [G] back to Fb to (Bar 3) Eb. If Herrmann had wanted to write the Fb as enharmonic E, he would have written E [F#] instead, as he did in *Citizen Kane* and other "Before" scores.

In Bar 4, the muted horns and two tubas play the pattern. Horn IV plays the root sequence of notes in the maj 7 chords. Once again these are transposing instruments, so we find Eb [written Bb a perfect 5th interval above] to Fb [Cb] to F [C] back to Fb to (Bar 5) Eb.

In Bars 5-6, the Fags, C. Fags, Pos and tubas play a full two bar progression of parallel maj 7th chords. We find Eb maj 7 to Fb maj 7 to F maj 7 to Gb maj 7 (Gb/Bb/Db/F) to (Bar 6) G maj 7 (G/B/D/F#) then back to the Gb maj 7 tonality. However, it is precisely here that Herrmann notated one of the very few enharmonic substitutions in the "After" period I have found so far. Whereas just previously the Pos/tubas played the Gb maj 7th as Gb/Bb/Db/F, here he notates the tonality as F#/Bb/C#/F (F# enharmonic Gb, and C# enharmonic Db). Was there a technical reason for this enharmonic notation of the non-transposing Pos and tubas? Perhaps so, but not being a trombone or tuba player, I cannot say. He repeats this enharmonic substitution in Bar 8 with the same sequence, and he also repeats it later on in Bar 5 of "The Vines" cue that is nearly identical to "The Bridge" cue. However, it is curious to note that, back in Bar 6 of "The Bridge," the non-transposing Fags and C. Fags also play this maj 7th descent but with no enharmonic substitution (unlike the Pos and tubas). So they play descending maj 7ths G maj 7th to Gb maj 7th (written as Gb/Bb/Db/F) to F maj 7th to Fb maj 7. Unless there is an explainable, technical reason why the tubas and Pos III & IV were notated with enharmonic notes (C# for Db, F# for Gb), then perhaps this is simply a rare case showing an anomaly, an instance of momentarily reverting back to past habits.

In Bar 8, the clarinets, bass clarinets, Fags, C. Fags, horns Pos and tubas play the same descent pattern of parallel maj 7ths. However, none of the other choirs use enharmonic substitutions for that Gb maj tonality (except, as given, the Pos and tubas).

In Bar 10 (page 49), the Pos/Fags/C. Fags again play the Fb maj 7 (written as Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb). In Bar 11, the clarinets/bass clarinets/horns play the Fb maj 7 (“correctly” written in terms of tertial interval lettering). In Bar 12, the bass clarinets/Fags/horns play the Fb maj 7 again. In Bar 13, the Pos & tubas play the Fb maj 7 chord. Then, in the final Bar 14, the clarinets/bass clarinets/horns play the chord, held fermata.

Once again, in “The Vines” cue (R10/3, page 53), the same pattern of maj 7th chords are evident overall but the horns are tacet (as well as the harps). So, in Bar 1, the Pos & tubas play Eb maj 7 to Fb maj 7 to F maj 7 back to F maj 7 (but there is no overlap of a half note chord in Bar 2, unlike “The Bridge”). In Bar 2, the Fags and C. Fags play the exact same pattern, then the clarinets & bass clarinets in Bar 3, etc. All choirs play the tertial interval sequencing of chords except, as mentioned above, the tubas & Pos III & IV in Bar 5 on the second chord when they use the C# and F# enharmonic substitution for the Gb maj 7 chord.

In “Magnetic Storm” (R 13/4, page 84). In the end Bars 24-25 the Pos play the Fb maj 7 written as Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb half notes tied to whole notes in Bar 25.

(3) In *City of Brass* (December 1934) on end page 30, we find in the 4th from the final bar the Fb maj 7 tonality, yet again it is notated with enharmonic E (instead of Fb) and enharmonic B (instead of Cb). More examples are likely to be found in this lengthy score, but unfortunately time ran out during my Saturday, April 29 research of Herrmann scores at UCSB. However, several examples of Herrmann’s frequent self-borrowing habit are given from this score in my paper, *Self-Borrowing in the Music of Bernard Herrmann*.

(4) In another major “Before” classification series of examples, we come now to Herrmann’s *Symphony*. The II Scherzo movement (titled “Hunt Scherzo” on the autograph score on page 37) demonstrates a great deal of enharmonic substitutions, not only of E for Fb and B for Cb but also other notational exchanges. In the last bar of page 37 (Bar 10) we see the first instance of multiple enharmonic substitutions. We find here (at the :10 point of track # 2 of the Koch cd recording of this work, James Sedares conducting the Phoenix Symphony) three trombones and a tuba playing a quickly ascending series of maj 7th tonalities. In 6/8 time signature, they play four quadruplet value quarter notes (bracketed “4”) rinforzando-marked (> glyph over each note) and p < f > p (crescendo-decrescendo). So what we *hear* are the F# maj 7th to G maj 7th to Cb maj 7th to Bb maj 7th chords. What is written are as follows:

F#/A#/C#/F
G/B/D/F#
B/Eb/Gb/Bb
Bb/D/F/A

The second and fourth chords (G maj 7 & Bb maj 7) are notated “correctly” (in terms of standard tertial-interval letter sequencing). The first chord is has the last note of the F# maj 7 written, interestingly enough, as an F note instead of E#. So instead of the “technically correct” sequencing of F#/A#/C#/E#, Herrmann notated F#/A#/C#/F (F enharmonic to E#). That F note is played by Pos I. This is an interesting switch since in

most cases we find the E substituting for the Fb note instead of the F substituting for the E#. The third chord is actually heard as the Cb maj 7th (Cb/Eb/Gb/Bb in tertial-interval structuring) but Herrmann enharmonically substitutes the Cb with the B (played by the tuba).

This pattern in Bar 10 is repeated in Bar 24. It is repeated in Bar 25 with the first two chords as indicated above (as 8th note chords) but the final two chords are 16th note chords (followed by an 8th rest). The Bar 10 pattern is also repeated in Bar 52 (page 42), Bar 61 (page 43), and Bar 233 (page 62). This pattern is repeated in Bar 191 (page 57) but now played by the woodwinds. So, for example, in the first chord of the F# maj 7, oboe I plays the F# note, oboe II plays A#, flute II plays C#, and flute I plays F (instead of the correctly spelled E#). Similarly, in Bar 241 (page 63), the strings play this pattern. The divisi basses play F#/A#, the celli play A#, but the divisi violins play C#/F (instead of C#/E#).

In Bars 18-19 (:19-:22 on the cd), 2 violins I and 2 violas are highlighted as they play descending parallel maj 7th chords in dotted quarter note notation. So we hear Gb maj 7 to F maj 7 to (Bar 19) Fb maj 7 to Eb maj 7 to (Bar 20) D maj 7 to Db maj 7.

These are written as follows:

Gb/Bb/Db/F
F/A/C/E
E/Ab/Cb/Eb
Eb/G/Bb/D
D/Gb/A/Db
Db/F/Ab/C

The first two chords (in Bar 18) are ok in terms of normal letter sequencing of third-interval seventh chords being notated. However, the first chord in Bar 19, while heard as the Fb maj 7 (Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb) is written, as seen before in our *Citizen Kane* discussion, as E/Ab/Cb/Eb (the E substituting enharmonically as the written note for Fb). The following Eb maj 7 chord is fine. However, the first chord in Bar 20, while heard as the D maj 7 tonality (normally written as D/F#/A/C#), is written here as D/Gb/A/Db (Gb equivalent to F#, and Db equivalent to C#). Perhaps there is a perfectly valid technical reason for this enharmonic exchange, or it is possible Herrmann simply wanted to keep the descent in a continuous line of flattened notes (without having that odd-man D maj chord with the two sharp notes). The final Db maj 7 chord is fine.

In Bar 202 (page 58), the trombones and tuba play the combined Fb maj 7 tonality (Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb) dotted half note chord. Pos III plays the Ab note, Pos II plays Cb, and Pos I plays Eb. However, the tuba plays E written enharmonic note instead of the “correctly” spelled Fb.

(5) In another of the “Before” classification, we come to the “Netta’s Death” cue (R6/1B, page 25) of the 1945 feature film, *Hangover Square*. After the “Cold Music” sequence of Bars 1-6 (see my paper “Self-Borrowing In the Music Of Bernard Herrmann”) four bass clarinets are *soli* playing a three-bar passage of half note chords. We find E/Ab/Cb/Eb to Eb/Cb/Eb/G to (Bar 8) F#/B/D/F# to F/C/E/A to (Bar 9) E/Cb/Eb/Ab to Eb/D/G/B. The first chord is the Fb maj 7 tonality again but we find bass clarinet IV playing to the written E [F#] instead of Fb [Gb]. The same occurs with the first chord in Bar 9 but in a slightly different arrangement (not root position this time) of E/Cb/Eb/Ab.

At the end bar (Bar 18), we find the Pos playing the Ab/Cb/Eb half notes held fermata, while the four bass clarinets play the Fb tonality, written E [F#]. So once again we have the Fb maj 7 chord (Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb).

(6) We come now to the 1941 feature film *All That Money Can Buy* (later more commonly known as *The Devil and Daniel Webster*). The “Litany of Death” cue (R10/M101) offers more examples of enharmonic substitution. *Adagio* in C time, we find a series of half note chords throughout the entire cue (except for the final two bars). The cue is dominated with the major seventh chords, starting off with the D maj 7 played by the C.F./Fags/bass clarinet/clarinets. In Bar 5, however, the first half note chord is the Bb half-diminished 7th (Bb/Db/Fb/Ab). The contra bassoon and bass clarinets plays the E enharmonic note (as written) instead of the Fb. So the C.F. has the written Great octave register E half note, while the bass clarinet has notated in the *chalumeau* register written F# (transposed to E), instead of the written Gb (transposed to Fb). In Bar 17, the first half note chord played by the alto flutes/clarinets/bass clarinet is the Cb maj 7 (Cb/Eb/Gb/Bb). However, the bass clarinets play the written B enharmonic note (written C# transposed to B) instead of written Db (transposed to Cb).

In the nine-bar cue “Winter” (R7/M70), we find in Bar 4 four muted violins playing (*Lento* in C time) the second half note chord as the Fb maj 7 tonality yet violin IV plays the E Line 2 register note instead of Fb. In “Winter, Version B” the same Fb maj 7 chord is played in bar 4 by two flutes and two clarinets. Once again we find the enharmonic E note played (here by clarinet II) instead of Fb.

In “Hataway’s Warning” (M119), we find in Bar 7 the F maj 7 (F/A/C/E) to Fb maj 7 (Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb) half note chords played by three muted trombones, contra bassoon, and bass clarinet. We find two enharmonic substitutions in this one Fb maj 7 chord. The C.F. and bass clarinets play the Eb note, and Pos I plays the Ab note. However, the other trombones play the enharmonic E/B notes instead of the correctly spelled/written Fb/Cb.

(7) In another “Before” example, we come to the “Jane’s Departure” cue (R1/2, page 12) of the 1943 feature film, *Jane Eyre*. In “old” Bars 34-35 (“new” bars 55-56) in 6/8 time signature, we find the muted horns playing (after a quarter & 8th rest) the quarter and then 8th note Fb maj 7th chords to (Bar 35 or “new” Bar 56) the Fb maj 7 dotted half note chord tied to next two bars. However, once again we see horn IV playing the written enharmonic E [B] notes instead of the Fb [Cb] notes. The bassoons and the bass clarinet also play the E notes as well.

In page 17 (Bar 70/191), these same instruments play the same Fb maj 7 chord with the enharmonic E instead of Fb. In page 18 (Bar 78/99) this occurs again with the bass clarinets and horns, tied to next two bars.

(8) In his concert work *Moby Dick* (Feb ’37-Aug ’38), we see in Bar 34 (Section C) the Ab min/9 tonality (Ab/Cb/Eb/Bb) but written as Ab/B/Eb/Bb (B enharmonic for Cb). In Bars 191-198 (Section J) we hear the Cb maj 7 (Cb/Eb/Gb/Bb) tonality but written as B/Eb/Gb/Bb. There were no chords found so far that incorporated the Fb tone (such as the Fb maj 7th or Db min).

(9) In his opera *Wuthering Heights* (1943-1951) we find in Act I Scene I (probably written between 1943-1945) on page 70 in Bar 158 the Gb Dom7 tonality (Gb/Bb/Db/Fb) played by the clarinets. However, clarinet II plays to the written E [F#] instead of the Fb [Gb] written note.

(10) *Ghost & Mrs. Muir* (1947) may be a pivotal year demonstrating the “After” era. Based on my research, the dividing line would occur sometime after 1945 and before 1951. Herrmann composed no movies after 1947 until 1951 since he was busy with finishing his dream work, *Wuthering Heights*. He wrote three sketch cues (two unfinished) for *Portrait of Jennie* (not including the Jennie theme), but that project fell through in 1948. He only composed a small handful of radio works in that period before 1951.

In “The Spring Sea” cue (R8/1-8/2, page 93) of *Ghost & Mrs. Muir*, two horns in Bar 36 play the Cb [Gb] half note while the harp plays the Ab-Cb-Eb arpeggio and the viole play on note F. So we see and hear the F half-diminished seventh chord. In Bar 7, the clarinets play (like the celli & harp II) Gb/Bb while harp I plays the Cb maj 7 arpeggio 3rd inversion (Bb-Cb-Eb-Gb). This transitions into F half-dim 7th with the clarinets/celli/harp II playing F/Ab while harp I plays the arpeggio.

Being a romantic score (not a “dark” score per se), there were really no examples seen of darker chords utilizing the Fb notes. However, none of the chords with the Cb note built-in had enharmonic B used in its place. And from what I could examine so far of the 1946 film *Anna & the King of Siam*, no representative dark chords utilizing Fb notes could be found.

(11) However, in *Snows of Kilimanjaro* (1952) we find in Bar 21 of the “Adagietto” cue (R4/2) a Db min7 chord (Db/Fb/Ab/Cb) written as such. The harp and celli play both the Fb and Cb notes while the viole play the Fb notes. While I saw no Fb notes or chords used in that year’s *Five Fingers*, I did spot F half diminished chords written in normal tertial fashion. An example is “The Pursuit” cue end bars 146-7 with the F-Ab-Cb-Eb clearly notated.

In “The Dunes” cue (R6/1) of *King of the Khyber Rifles* (1953) we find in Bar 3 the unusual Fb maj triad (Fb/Ab/Cb) written as such for the harp and also the clarinets and bass clarinets. So, for the latter, Fb[Gb]/Ab[Bb]/Cb[Db]. In “The Message” cue in Bar 4, the Ab min is written as expected Ab/Cb/Eb. Incidentally, Ab minor chords are seen in the 1951 film *On Dangerous Ground*, all played as expected. This is seen at the end of “Pastorale,” in Bar 1 of “The Elegy” cue as the Pos play the Eb min to Ab min chords. In “The Whispering” the Cb maj is written as Cb/Eb/Gb in Bar 4 by the clarinets and bass clarinet, repeated in Bars 9-10. In “The House” in Bar 2, the strings play the written F-Ab-Cb-Eb (F half-dim 7th). This chord is also seen in “Pastorale” in Bar 19. The “Hunt Scherzo” has several examples of the Pos and trumpets playing the Ab/Cb/Eb chords, as well as Bar 21 of “The Cabin” played by the trumpets. No Fb chords and notes were seen so far.

(12) Let’s focus now on Herrmann final score, *Taxi Driver* (1975) since it displays many of the features discussed in the “Prelude” of *Citizen Kane*—but without the enharmonic notes. In the {Pussy & the 44} cue (R5/1A, page 20) or Cue XI, we hear the tubas/Pos/horns playing in C time a descent of half note maj 7 chords (except the final chord). So we hear I believe at the :48 point on the expanded cd, the Fb maj 7 to Eb maj 7 to (next bar) Db maj 7 to C half-diminished 7th. Following the root position notes, we see written for horn IV/Pos IV/tuba II half notes Fb to Eb to (next bar) Db to C.

This score has dark scenes and corresponding “dark” music just as in the “Prelude” to *Citizen Kane*. It is interesting or even ironic that the very first movie score of Herrmann’s would have those unusual Fb maj 7 chords to help depict the strange

elderly Kane character in the “Prelude” and then to find the very last movie of Herrmann’s having the same Fb maj 7 to Eb maj 7 pairing to depict the strange young character of “Travis” (Robert DeNiro). Again, as I discussed earlier, it is rather difficult to find the unusual Fb chords, but *Taxi Driver* is a film that fits such musical treatment, and apparently Herrmann at least subconsciously felt that way about the subject matter. The “Prelude” is the true oddity of *Citizen Kane*, and what you find there is found nowhere else in that score, including the “Finale.” Similarly, the Travis character is a dark oddity and a sense of submerged danger and expectation of the unusual is always implied. The chords used and the conditions were pretty much the same for both cues except that Herrmann changed how he would notate those chords. When I first focused on Kane’s “Prelude” I was not immediately aware of the chord because of the enharmonic substitutions. Herrmann never used such substitutions for Fb chords in later scores such as *Journey To The Center of the Earth* and in *Taxi Driver*. I was not expecting enharmonic exchanges. So I did not immediately recognize the Fb maj 7 “sound” because I do not have perfect pitch nor did I ever receive ear training. So I depended on what I “read” on paper (the score). At first I thought Herrmann was experimenting with some sort of interval relationship involving the diminished 8th or augmented 1st (for example, E to Eb, or Eb to E; C to C#, or C# to C, etc). So when I saw the awkward looking chord of E-Ab-Cb-Eb or even E-Ab-B-Eb, I initially wondered what I was looking at. Finally it dawned on me that Herrmann was practicing something he did not engage in later on; namely, enharmonic substitutions.

In Cue XII (R5/2) we see in Bar 1 the bass clarinets, C.B. clarinets, Fags and C. Fags all playing the written (un-enharmonic) Fb maj 7 chord. Then in Bar 5, the Pos and tubas play the written Fb maj 7 to Eb maj 7 chords.

(13) In the 1958 war film *Naked & The Dead*, we find many examples non-enharmonic substitutions. In the striking brass-dominated cue “The Snake” three of six Pos play the Ab/Cb/Eb written chord (Ab min) in Bars 6-7. In Bar 10, Pos I-II-III play the written Db min triad (Db/Fb/Ab). Horns play the Db min as written in Bars 22-23, do Db[Ab]/Fb[Cb]/Ab[Eb]. In Bar 19, the trumpets play the expected Ab/Cb/Eb chord, and so forth throughout the busy cue. In the rapid triplet descent in “The Fall,” we first hear the D min to Db min to (Bar 3) the C min, etc., played by the clarinets and trumpets, notated as expected. In “The Grenades,” Bar 1, horns 5-8 play the Ab minor chord into Bar 2, then Bars 11-12. In “Wilson’s Death,” Bar 16, open horns 5-8 play the “properly” notated Ab min chord. In Bar 17 the cup-muted trumpets 1-3 do likewise, and so forth.

In “Prayer & Rescue” Pos play in Bars 16-17 the Db min triad as expected (Db/Fb/Ab). In “Croft’s Death” in Bar 20, the horns and Pos play the Ab min chord. In “The Buzzards” the cup-muted trumpets 1-3 play the Ab min chords as expected in Bar 21, then the Pos in Bar 23. In “Waterfalls” all six Pos play the chord in Bar 5, and so forth. There is no need to continue with examples here.

(14) In *Cape Fear* (1961) there are more examples of the “After” period of non-enharmonic chords. In “The Spike” cue (R14/3), celli, basses and horns play the Db min chord in Bar 3 as expected. In “The Wall” (R13/3) in 4/2 time, the VC/CB (celli & basses) combined play largely minor half note triads in the third bar. The CB plays the root note. So we find Eb/Gb/B to D/F/A half note triads, then Db/Fb/Ab (as written—not the E enharmonic note) to Cb/Eb/Gb triads. The Db minor chord is also notated in Bar 7. In “The Struggle” (R14/1), we find a series of minMaj 7 chords in Bars 1-8, *molto*

allegro in $\frac{3}{4}$ time signature. Celli play the root note, viole the Third note, violins II the Fifth, and violins I the Seventh. So we see the D minMaj 7 half note chord to Eb minMaj 7 quarter note chord to (Bar 2) the Db minMaj 7 (Db/Fb/Ab/C) half note chord to C minMaj 7 quarter note chord. Bars 3-4 = Bars 1-2. The Fb note is written as such for the viole.

(15) In *Twisted Nerve* (1968) we see in the “Main Title” the Bb half-diminished 7 chord (Bb/Db/Fb/Ab) being played in Bars 57, 63-4, 65-66.

(16) In *Sisters* (1972) we find “The Clinic” cue dominated by half-diminished seventh chords. In Bars 1-2 the arpeggiated violins plays the C to B half-dim 7th chords. In Bar 3, most relevantly here in our discussion, we find the Bb half-dim 7 chord (Bb/Db/Fb/Ab) and written as such, then the A half-dim 7.

(17) Returning to the “Before” era, we come to a *Columbia Workshop* radio show episode of “A Trip To Czardis” (12-15-38). In Cue VII, Bars 1-2, we find two horns and one trombone playing minor triads in C time signature. With the trombone on the bottom line (horns playing the top two notes), Herrmann notates the C/E/A (A min 1st inversion) to B/Eb/Ab half note triads to (Bar 2) Ab/C/F (F min 1st inv) whole note chord. The second chord given is the Ab min 1st inversion tonality (Cb/Eb/Ab) but the trombone plays the written B note instead (enharmonic to Cb). Curiously horn I plays A to Ab, and horn II plays written E to Eb half notes, but for some reason Herrmann did not notate the trombone transition of C to Cb. In the “After” era, however, he would consistently do just that for the A min and Ab min chords.

(18) In the *Columbia Presents Corwin* radio episode “Walt Whitman” (June 20 '44), Bar 4 or cue II (“Suspense Processional #1”) offers another Fb maj 7 tonality. Once again in this “Before” era, however, Herrmann did not seem to want to notate the Fb note, for whatever reason, unlike in later years. At the end of Bar 4, the violins play the Ab/Cb/Eb chords. The viole/cellis/basses/piano play the written E notes. The chimes, glock and harp play full bar value (dotted whole note in 5/4 meter) E notes. It is remotely possible, a skeptic may counter, that Herrmann simply wanted to accentuate the E note/tone and had the violins overlay with the Ab min chord (Ab/Cb/Eb). However, in the earlier three bars, he notates the C maj 7 (C/E/G/B) and the F maj 7 (F/A/C/E) chords as well.

This pattern is repeated in Cue III (“Suspense Processional #2”), Bars 4-5, and also Cue XVI (“Suspense Processional #5”), Bars 12-13.

(19) Quite surprisingly, near the conclusion of my research into this matter, I finally found one cue in the several dozens of Herrmann scores I studied in the “After” period that actually harkens back to the “Before” practice of enharmonic substitution of the Fb note. This is seen in the 1971 feature film *Battle of Neretva* in cue IV “The Tanks” (aka “Turning Point” in LP/compact disc release). I am assuming that this cue is an original composition, not an instance of self-borrowing from the “Before” period. *Allegro Pesante* in 9/8 time signature, we hear a tutti performance of a one-bar ostinato pattern. Flutes/English horns/clarinets/horns/trumpets/snare drums/tenor drums/violins/viole play the ostinato figure of two delayed triplets (dotted 8th-16th-8th) to triplet 8ths. They all play the Ab/Cb/Eb delayed triplets to G/Bb/D triplet 8ths in Bar 1 (repeated in Bar 2). Then they play F# min to F min in Bars 3-4, then Ab min to G min in Bars 5-6, Gb maj 7 (Gb/Bb/Db/F) to F/B/D/F# in Bars 7-8, and so forth.

Back in Bar 1, the bass clarinets/Fags/C.Fags/Pos/tubas/VC/CB play the E dotted half note (duration equivalent to the two delayed triplets) legato to the F dotted quarter note (duration of the three 8th note triplet figure of G/Bb/D). So we *hear* the Fb maj 7 chord, but Herrmann notates the E enharmonic note instead of the Fb note. These first two bars are repeated in Bars 47-48, although the ostinato pattern is raised an octave.

Did Herrmann simply lapse temporarily into his old habit? Or was there a “variable” involved that necessitated this enharmonic exchange? The Fb/E tone is not part of the ostinato pattern. It is indeed part of the overall tonality, but the ostinato is comprised of two minor triads (Ab/Cb/Eb to G/Bb/D). The Fb as root bestows a maj-min-maj tertial structure so that it becomes a major seventh chord tonality. My initial impression is that this notation was simply what can be called an automatic “judgement call.” or automatic response in which he reverted back to his old enharmonic practice. I am not a professional musicologist, so I can be mistaken. However, if there were valid variables involved, I find it curious that he would not notate in similar enharmonic manner in the hundreds of other “After” examples I have researched. Once again, this is the *only* example I have found (so far) of a return to the enharmonic substitution common in his early compositions.

(20) In the 1967 concert work *Souvenirs de Voyage* (Clarinet Quintet), we find in movement I the muted strings playing the Fb maj 7 chord (written as such). *Dolce e espr* in 2/2 time, the Bb solo clarinet plays the *chalumeau* register Fb [written Gb a whole tone above] quarter note in the grace bar up to (Bar 1) Line 1 register Eb [F] half note to descending triplet value quarter notes Fb-Db-Bb up to (Bar 2) Ab quarter note to Gb half note (all notes played legato under the phrase/slur curve line0. In Bar 1, after a quarter rest, the celli/viole/violins play the Eb dotted half note tonality to (Bar 2) the Ab min/9 (Ab/Cb/Eb/Bb) dotted half note chord (followed by a quarter rest). Then, in Bar 3, we see the strings playing the Fb maj (Fb/Ab/Cb) whole note chord to (bar 4) the Ab min/9 dotted half note chord again. The divisi celli play Fb/Cb whole notes, the viole Fb, violins II small octave register Ab, and violins I Line 1 Fb whole note.

(21) In *Night Digger* (1971) we find in cue XXIX (page 32) in Bar 6 the strings playing the non-enharmonic written Fb maj 7 chord. The celli play the Fb/Cb notes. In cue XXXIII in Bar 5, this pattern is repeated.

(22) While perusing through the 1974 score *It's Alive*, I did not find any Fb chords or Db minor chords. However, there were a good deal of F half-diminished 7 chords (F-Ab-Cb-Eb), and similarly the Ab min triads played by various instrumental choirs, and I never saw the Cb note being substituted for the enharmonic B note.

(23) Another major example of the Fb maj7 to Eb maj 7 chords (see discussion on *Taxi Driver* and *Journey To The Center of the Earth*) involves that famous atmospheric cue in *Vertigo* titled “The Forest (R7/C, page 49) where Scottie and Madeleine stroll through the eerie redwoods. *Largo* in C time signature, three muted trombones and one muted tuba play major seventh chords. Three basses play the tuba line of half notes Cb to Bb to (Bar 2) Cb to C. Although not voiced in root position, we nevertheless hear the Fb maj 7 (Pos play Fb/Ab/Eb) to Eb maj 7 (actually voiced as Bb/Eb/G/D) to (Bar 2) Fb maj 7 again to F maj 7 (voiced as C/F/A/E) half note chords. The Fb and Cb notes are not enharmonically notated. In Bars 5-6, the Pos/tuba/bass clarinets play the Eb maj 7 to D maj 7 to (Bar 6) F maj 7 to Fb maj 7. In Bar 7, the muted horns play the F maj 7 to Fb

maj 7 half note chords. These are of course transposed equivalences of the written notes (perfect 5th intervals above); so Fb[Cb]/Ab[Eb]/Cb[Gb]/Eb[Bb].

Bars 3-4 are also played by the horns but display a bit of a mystery the way notated. We find Fb/Ab/Db/G to Eb/G/C/F# half note chords to (Bar 4) Db/F/B/E to Cb/Fb/Ab/Eb. That final or fourth chord is clearly the Fb maj 7, but the other chords are not so clear! Since enharmonic notes are not apparently used, I will leave them alone for now.

(24) In *Marnie* (1964) in the “Prelude,” we find in Bar 59 (in 4/2 time) the F/A to Fb/Ab whole note dyads being played by the flutes, English horns, clarinets, bassoons, and combined lower strings. In “Encounter” (pages 51-52), we find in Bar 9 the F half-diminished seventh (F/Ab/Cb/Eb) notated to (Bar 10) the Bb maj b 5 (Bb/D/Fb). In “The Nightmare” at the end Bar 36 (page 85), the strings in C time play the whole note F half-diminished 7 chord, held fermata. VC/CB play note F, viole play F/A dyad, violins II play Ab/Eb, and violins I play written Cb/Eb. The bass clarinet also plays F[G]. In “The Money” in page 117 the F half-diminished 7 chord is played by the strings as fingered tremolos at the final Bar 44. The horns and woodwinds play the chord as well in normal third-interval notation.

In “The Park” (R12/C) the strings play at end Bar 16 the F half-diminished 7 chord, held fermata. Divisi celli play Ab/F, viole play the written notes F/Ab, and violins play Cb/Eb.

(25) An interesting example of the only “mix” of both enharmonic and non-enharmonic use may be seen in the 1954 feature film, *Garden of Evil*. In “The Cards” (R11/2) in Bar 24 as the solo English horn plays a three-bar phrase (Bars 23-25), the strings play a clearly notated Fb maj 7 chord. The viole play the written Fb note, as well as celli II. Celli I play Cb, and violins I play Cb/Eb. Violins II play the written notes Ab/Eb.

In “Fuller’s Death” (R10/3) in Bar 37 (start of section H at the 1:30 point), we may find an example of the same chord notated with the Fb notated as enharmonic note E. This is not clear cut because of the different movement lines played by varying instrumental choirs, so passing tones/notes may be involved. It is a bit involved to elaborate here, but first you hear the Pos and English horns and strings (except basses) playing (in C time) the Ab/Cb/Eb half note tonality. After a quarter rest, clarinets III & IV play the Ab/Cb dotted half notes. Clarinets I & II play unison the Eb [F] quarter note to D half note. The violins also play the D quarter note (followed by a quarter rest) while the basses (after a quarter rest) plays the E half note to F quarter note. The bass clarinet plays like the CB, as also the two bassoons. The bass clarinet is notated, however, as written note F# (or the E note in concert pitch) instead of written Gb (concert pitch Fb). So momentarily at least we hear the Fb maj 7 tonality notated enharmonically, but once again, this is not a clear-cut example. It is worth a mention as *indicative* of an enharmonic Fb maj 7 chord, but not clearly evident as “The Tanks” cue in *Battle of Neretva*.

(26) In a far clearer case of mixed notation in the “After” period (as given in the “Parts” pages not notated by Herrmann), we come to the 1963 (scored 1962) feature film, *Jason & the Argonauts*. In the “Trapped” cue (R8/3), we see a series of descending parallel minor triads. Set in 6/8 time signature, horns and trombones play the delayed triplet to dotted quarter note pattern, while the English horns and bassoons plays a

descending series of dotted quarter note triads. In Bar 1, we see the brass playing the Eb minor (Eb/Gb/Bb) delayed triplet (dotted 8th to 16th to 8th notes) to the D min (D/F/A) dotted quarter note triad to (Bar 2) the Db min (Db/Fb/Ab) delayed triplet to C min (C/Eb/G) dotted quarter note chord. The English horns play all of those chords as dotted quarter notes (“correctly” notated). The bassoons, however, play the Db min triad in Bar 2 as Db/E/Ab (E enharmonic for Fb). So this is the only instance of an “oddball” notation, enharmonically speaking, despite the fact that the other instrumental choirs play the written Fb note. But remember, these are the “Parts” pages for each individual instrument line, notated by somebody else.

However, in the autograph score written by Herrmann, he notates that Db minor triad for the bassoons as Db/Fb/Ab. There are 6 bassoons, so Fags II & V play the Fb note. So in actuality this is not an instance of enharmonic substitution, but I thought it interesting that the copyist assigned to the bassoons decided to “alter” the Fb to read as E.

In “Medea” (R8/7), we see in Bar 6 bass clarinets and clarinet III playing the Fb maj triad (notated as Fb/Ab/Cb in concert pitch or written Gb/Bb/Db) tied to next bar. In Bar 10, they play the Fb maj chord again.

(27) In Herrmann’s *Police Force* suite composed in early 1957 for CBS-television (music used as “stock” music for various CBS series such as *Gunsmoke* and *Perry Mason*), we find examples of the “After” period. In “Middle Tag B” in Bar 2, the trombones and tuba play the Db min (Db/Fb/Ab) chord. Here the tuba plays the Db note while the Pos play the Fb/Ab notes (as written). In cue V “Clues” (cue # 363), we find the Pos play ostinato Ab min (Ab/Cb/Eb) 8th note chords from Bars 1-8. Then the trumpets take over this pattern in Bars 9-19, followed by the horns. The chords are correctly spelled in each brass choir. In “Opening D” in Bar 5, the Pos and tuba play the F half-dim 7th (F/Ab/Cb/Eb) with the tuba playing note F. In the previous Bar 3, the horns played this seventh chord as well.

(28) In the so-called *Indian Suite* composed in 1957 for CBS-TV, we find more examples of the “After” period of correctly spelled chords. For example, in “Indian Suspense” (cue #223) the end Bar 48 shows a polychord mix. The trumpets play the G min (G/Bb/D) chord while the Pos play the Ab/Cb/Eb (as written Ab minor triad). In “Indian Signals” (cue # 226) the same polychord tonalities are played by the horns and trumpets in Bars 21-24, then in the end Bar 46.

(29) Many *Crime Classics* radio show episodes show examples of the “After” period of non-enharmonic substitution. In *John Hayes* (10-28-53) in cue I (self-borrowed also in cue II of *John & Judith*), we find the Cb maj 7 chord in Bar 2 (written as such), followed by the Fb maj chord in Bar 3, then the Ab min in Bar 4. In *Widow Magee & the Three Gypsies* (4-28-54), the harp plays the Cb maj 7 chord in cues I, V, VIII, XI, and XIII (all written as Cb/Eb/Gb/Bb). In *General Ketchum* we find the harp playing in Bars 1-4 of cue X the Cb maj 7 chord as well. In cue XIV, the harp plays in Bar 1 the Fb maj 7 (written as Fb/Ab/Cb/Eb). In *Mr. Thrower’s Hammer* we find the Cb maj 7 chord notated as such in cue VI (Bars 3-4), cue XI (Bars 1-6), and cue XII (Bar 12). This is also seen in *Frank Pizarro* in Bars 7-8 in cue IV. Many examples of the simple Ab min (Ab/Cb/Eb) triad as notated as such in various episodes such as *Death of a Picture Hanger* (ex., Bars 1-2 in cue X played by the Pos), *The Bloody Bloody Banks of Fall River* (ex., cue X played by the Hammond organ), cue IV played by three English horns in *The Incredible History of John Shepard*, and so forth.

(30) In the *Twilight Zone* episode “Ninety Years Without Slumbering” (starring Ed Wynn), the Bb half-diminished 7th (Bb/Db/Fb/Ab) is notated as such and played by the harp in cue XI, Bars 22, 24, 28, 29, 36, and 42. The F half-diminished 7th (F/Ab/Cb/Eb) is written as such and played by the harp in Bars 44 & 47.

While many more examples can be illustrated, hopefully these will suffice to show the pattern of enharmonic substitution (and their overall absence) in the “Before” and “After” periods of Herrmann’s works.

Completed Friday, May 17 2002 8:26 pm PDT

Copyright ©Bill Wrobel 2002
